DRAFT

Proceedings
of the

International Workshop on Enforcing Wildlife Trade Controls in the Russian Far East and North East Asia

15.-19. November 1999
Vladivostok, Russia

TRAFFIC
EUROPE
compiled by

with the kind support of

THE NATIONAL FISH AND WILDLIFE FOUNDATION
SAVE THE TIGER FUND

Content

Agenda

Monday, 15. November 1999

14.00- Arrival & registration of participants

Tuesday, 16. November 1999

9.00h Opening Cerenomy
Welcoming by:
Tom De Meulenaer, Director of TRAFFIC Europe
V. Il'yashenko, Deputy-Head of the Russian CITES Management Authority
Karin V. Elliot, Representative of the Global Survival Network

Part I:

Wildlife trade and wildlife trade Regulations in the Russian Far East and North East Asia
Moderator: V. Il'yashenko (CITES Management Authority of Russia)

Wildlife trade in the Russian Far East - an overview
by Alexey Vaisman, TRAFFIC Europe - Russia

Basic CITES Provisions and Regional Characteristics
by V. Il'yashenko, CITES Management Authority of Russia

Presentation Session I. Custom procedures and controls for trade with CITES Specimens.

Customs provisions for CITES Specimens in trade.
Procedures for illegally traded specimens.
Disposal of confiscated specimens.

Presentations by representatives of the Russian Federation,
the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Korea

Presentation Session II. Legal framework for performing CITES trade controls.

Review of existing legislation with brief characteristic and evaluation of their effectiveness and practical use.
Co-operation and collaboration with foreign states.

Presentations by representatives of the Russian Federation,
the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Korea

Evening

Special: Poaching and Human-Tiger conflicts in the Russian Far East
Video session + open discussion forum
Moderator: Representative of the Russian Anti-poaching brigade

Wednesday, 17. November 1999

Part II:

Enforcing wildlife trade controls
Moderator: Tom De Meulenaer (TRAFFIC Europe)

Illegal wildlife trade in the region - an overview

- **Tigers in the Russian Far East**

by P. Fomenko, WWF-RPO RFE

- **Overview of the work of the "Tiger Inspection"**

by B. Kopaev *("Tiger" Inspectorate)*

- **Conserving Musk Deer - the use of and trade in wild musk**

by Stephanie Theile, TRAFFIC Europe

- **Ginseng in the Russian Far East**

by Alexey Vaisman, TRAFFIC Europe-Russia

- **Traditional Medicines in East Asia**

by Vincent Chen, TRAFFIC East Asia-Taipei

- **Trade in Marine species in the Russian Far East**

by Alexey Vaisman, TRAFFIC Europe-Russia

- **Halting the illegal trade in animals and plants in Russia: the role of the WWF Russian Programme office**

by A. Shestakov, WWF RPO

Presentation Session III. Detecting and identifying CITES specimens in trade.

Procedure for detecting wildlife in trade and evaluation of their efficiency.
Proposals to improve existing procedures.

Presentations by representatives of the Russian Federation,
the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Korea

Presentation session IV. CITES training for Customs Officers.

Current training activities.
Training needs.

Presentations by representatives of the Russian Federation,
the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Korea

Thursday, 18. November 1999

Part III:

Improving wildlife trade controls in the Region
Moderator: A Shestakov (WWF RPO)

Discussion forum: Regional collaboration for a better implementation of CITES and to improve wildlife trade controls.

Items for discussion:

- The need to conserve the regions' Biodiversity.
- Improvement of regional collaboration and co-ordination on CITES trade controls.
- International agreements on CITES implementation.
- Exchange of samples and models of documents, signatures, and stamps.
- Streamlining identification and investigation procedures.
- Joint development and exchange of manuals, training materials and instructions.
- National legislation and their compatibility with CITES provisions.
- Translation into the languages of the countries in the region of key features of CITES and of the wildlife trade in the region.
- Information exchange on modifications in national and local legislation.
- Joint training for Customs Officers and other wildlife trade control agencies of the countries of the region.

Discussion on the workshop results. Closing ceremony.

Introduction

by Tom De Meulenear, Director of TRAFFIC Europe

Welcome to the 'International Workshop on Enforcing Wildlife Trade Controls in the Russian Far East and North East Asia'. As the Director of TRAFFIC Europe, the main organiser of this workshop, I am very pleased to welcome you here in Vladivostok and hope that we will have a successful and productive meeting.

First, I would like to introduce TRAFFIC Europe and its work. TRAFFIC Europe is part of the TRAFFIC Network, which, in support of its two partner organisations, IUCN – The World Conservation Union and WWF – World Wide Fund for Nature, helps to ensure that wildlife utilisation and trade remain sustainable, and is conducted in accordance with national and international laws and agreements. TRAFFIC was established in 1976 and is now operating through a network of 21 offices organised into seven regional offices. TRAFFIC Europe, through its regional office in Brussels and its five national offices, works across the Eurasian continent and covers an area of more than 50 countries. Its area of responsibility stretches from the European Union, through Central and Eastern Europe, Russia and other CIS countries, as far as the Russian Far East. This region has important centres of bio-diversity, with many species in demand to supply markets throughout the world.

The Russian Far East, a region rich in natural resources and home to some of the world's most endangered species, may be one of the most significant of these biodiversity hotspots. It contains some of the few remaining large wilderness areas and undeveloped spaces left on the planet. Its forests are amongst the largest and best preserved in the northern hemisphere, contain a rich biological diversity with habitat for rare and endangered species of global importance. These include the Siberian or Amur Tiger, *Panthera tigris altaica*. The most recent statistics available from the IUCN/SSC Cat Specialist Group indicate that there may be 437 to 506 Siberian Tigers left in Russia. Siberian Tigers are threatened because of habitat loss and fragmentation, over hunting of prey species, and poaching to supply the demand for Tiger parts, particularly bone, for use in traditional Asian medicines.

At present, there is extensive cross border trade from the Russian Far East to Asian countries, in particular China and South Korea. This includes a variety of wildlife and wildlife products, such as medicinal plants, Tigers, bears, musk deer, various marine products as well as timber. Much of this trade is uncontrolled and threatens native wildlife.

The international trade in endangered species such as Tigers, and products made from these species, is regulated under CITES. Although most countries in the region are Parties to CITES, there is little or no cross border collaboration to implement this important treaty. Efforts to co-ordinate CITES enforcement or to commonly tackle illegal wildlife trade, are insufficient. Controls aimed at reducing. However, controls over poaching and illegal trade in endangered species from Russia to its Asian neighbours can only be effective if there is good and continuos international collaboration between the responsible enforcement agencies in the region.

To achieve this, TRAFFIC Europe, in collaboration with Global Survival Network (GSN), Fund Phoenix, the Russian Programme Office of WWF, TRAFFIC East Asia and the State

Committee of the Russian Federation on Environmental Protection, has organised this workshop. It brings together for the first time, technical-level law enforcement officials and conservation experts from Russia, which is the key supply and transit country for endangered wildlife, including Tigers, with enforcement and conservation experts from key consumer markets of Tiger products in Asia, in particular China and Korea.

We hope that this workshop can contribute to enhanced regional collaboration amongst wildlife trade enforcement agencies in the Russian Far East and North East Asia. We also hope that this workshop will improve co-ordination of controls and anti-smuggling efforts along common borders. Such improvement will enhance the quality and efficiency of Tiger protection efforts and Tiger trade controls in the region.

Before we begin, I would like to express my gratitude to the Save the Tiger Fund, who has provided financial support for this workshop.

Lastly, I would like to express my best wishes for a very productive and successful meeting.

PART I

Wildlife trade and Wildlife Trade Regulations in the Russian Far East and North East Asia

Moderator:
V. Il'yashenko (CITES Management Authority of Russia)

Wildlife trade in the Russian Far East - an overview

by A.Vaisman, TRAFFIC Europe-Russia

The Russian Far East is among the most unfavourable regions of Russia from the point of view of illegal trade in wild plants and animals. In this region many natural, political and social-economic factors have united into a single whole as if in purpose to promote illegal hunting and business.

Fauna and flora of the region is very diverse, with the northern, Siberian and Manchurian species concentrating within one area. The region is located close to the countries of East Asia, that are traditional consumers of a wide variety of products and derivatives of animal and plant species. Growth of economic welfare of the consumer countries and effective consumer demand of their population.

Economic crises in Russia, decrease of incomes of the population, unemployment, collapse of many economic and industrial structures. The people are looking for a possibility to make their livings. Moreover, there appears a chance to become rich quickly.

Previously one of the basic economic activities in the Far East was fur procurement. Collapse of the fur procurement due to both external and internal reasons led to the present situation when over 90% of hunters in the Far East make their livings on illegal harvesting and trade in ginseng, musk dear pod, bear gall, antlers of young Siberian stag, etc.

Political changes in Russia in the early 1990s. Disparity of the old legislation to the sharply changed situation made the custom and environmental protection bodies powerless to stop growing illegal trade.

This gap has begun to be filled in just recently. Weakness of the legislation and disparity of powers of the executive bodies created favorable conditions for illegal trade in plants and animals. Starting from this trade, numerous powerful criminal groups were born and blooming, involving the executive power, law and order institutions and environmental protection bodies into the sphere of the influence.
The result of it was that a well-organised system of illegal trade in goods of the animal and plant origin was established in the region. Relatively safe passways for transit of the goods were

formed at the Russian borders with China and Northern Korea.

Review of species and types of trade

Speaking about the species involved in trade and about the types of trade in biological goods, first of all the trade should be subdivided into two types: export and import.

I. Import of goods of the animal and plant origin to the region from abroad is comparatively small. There is practically no demand for exotic animals in the region. Certainly, alive and stuffed animals are imported, but very few of them remain in the region. Major portion of the imported animals is transited to the European Russia. Also there is an illegal import of ready-made drugs of oriental medicine for the needs of growing Chinese and Korean communities.
Export makes a bigger part of the illegal trade turnover. Here we again have to divide the export into two types:

1. ***Export of goods of the animal and plant origin procured on land and in the shelf waters of the Far East.***

Tiger is one of the scantiest animal species. At the same time the demand for it in the illegal Far East market is the highest. All parts of tiger are used and highly valued in oriental medicine. The cost of tiger carcass in Khabarovsk at the peak of the demand in 1994-1996 reached US$15,000. The usual cost of a tiger bones set is US$2,000. In spite of all prohibitions and measures taken against illegal hunting, in spite of very severe punishment for illegal trade in tiger hides, bones, etc. introduced in China, about 50 animals are hunted annually. Certainly not all of them are shot for business. However, it should be mentioned that tiger bones and other derivatives are of a stable demand.

Musk deer is an alive ginseng. Musk deer pod is widely used in the traditional oriental medicine. The demand is stable. If previously, before the borders were open, musk deer was a common species like a hare and there was no demand for it, now we have to admit that it is one of the most endangered species due to the reason of its mass procurement and the following realization to Chinese and Korean dealers. In the northern areas of the Primorskiy Krai and in some areas of the Khabarovskiy Krai musk deer illegal hunting and trade in musk deer pod is the main way of making the earnings in the rural settlements. Purchase prices vary from US$1 to 3 per gram. In recent years the dealers began to take both traditionally dried pods, and frozen pods. This new «standard» supposes that pods are frozen together with the testis. Musk deer is caught mainly by loops, i.e. non-selectively. Thus, we may say that depending on a gender and age structure of the population, for one caught male there are from 3 to 5 vainly killed females and young animals. The volumes of trade in musk deer pod may be approximately estimated from the fact that at present only in South Korea, as far as I know, a case is being investigated about illegal export of about 1.5 tons of musk. Certainly musk deer is illegally procured not only in the Far East, but it should be mentioned that illegal export of musk deer pod from Siberia and Altai goes also through the Far East.
Bear. Demand for bear gall makes many hunters procure these animals. The greatest impact is

caused to the Asiatic black bear registered in the CITES Appendix 1, due to its better availability for procurement. By now the rush for gall has ceased and the prices have gone down from US$5-8 per gram in 1994-1995 to US$1-2. It is still early to say that the bears tend to decline in number in the Far East and Kamchatka. However, we must be on our guard.

Soft-shelled turtle has been more and more actively exported to China in recent years. It is transported alive. Only the day before yesterday custom officers stop an attempt to transport soft-shelled turtles under the floor of the carriage.
Recently a demand has been formed and is growing steadily for freshwater crabs. Their illegal export to China now is estimated at hundreds of kilograms.

Trepang. Marine ginseng. Export to China. It is harvested by diving, controlled by the criminals. At some areas up to 80% of active male population is engaged in this business. Mainly they export boiled and dried trepang. Mean price for 1 kg of dried trepang at the Chinese border is US$100. By our estimates based on interviews, about 15 tons of trepang are harvested during the season only in the Khasan area. Calculated for dry product, the profit in a successful month may reach US$1 million.

Among the other invertebrates actively harvested in shelf waters, sea gray hedgehog and scallop should be mentioned. Harvesting and illegal export of these animals takes place mainly in the Northern Primorie, where this business belongs mainly to non-local harvesters and boats, mostly coming from Sakhalin, that are mainly working for the Japanese market.

Ginseng is traditionally used in oriental medicine and is a traditional object for harvesting and export. In the last century ginseng was mainly harvested and exported by Chinese persons to China and Korea. At present wild ginseng population is ruthlessly destroyed by numerous illegal harvesters. By our estimates the number of harvesters in the last years exceeds the one in the beginning of the century (the peak of the procurement) 5 times. The volume of illegal export to China (mainly) and Korea (to a smaller degree) by the data of TRAFFIC Europe is from 1,500 to 2,000 kg annually. In the Hong Kong prices it equals to US$ 80 million per year.

Among the other harvested and exported herbs we may name *Oplopanax elatus, Aristolochia manshuriensis* and *Rhodiola rosea*.

Timber. The analysis shows that on the studied sites the real felling volumes exceed the official figures by 1.5. Satellite imageries show that felling areas often differ from the areas marked in the forestry maps in location and configuration. Felling areas in the river valleys, in mixed forest «crawl» up the hills into the cedar and oak forests. It is not easy to estimate the volumes of illegal timber export, we have not got these data yet. However, there are indirect data showing that this business is active. Teams of the «Tiger» Inspection and group «Kedr» stop at night log trucks carrying the illegally cut timber from the Sikhote-Alin' down to the sea. There are many small military ports on the seashore where they can easily reload timber to boats without any control.

2. *Illegal export of fish and sea goods.*

In this case we have to speak about the trade covering the whole Russian part of the North Pacific Ocean. Here is a complex of various problems including imperfect legislation, weak control, corruption, huge financial potential of the criminal and half-criminal groups. I will give details in a separate presentation. Now I will just say that the volume of illegal export of sea goods from territorial waters of Russia and the waters of the Russian exclusive economic zone is estimated by experts from US$1.5 to 4.5 billion per year.

Basic CITES Provisions and Regional Characteristics

by V. Il'yashenko CITES Management Authority of Russia

Last year, representatives of the CITES Management Authorities of Japan, the People's Republic of China, the Russian Federation and of the Republic of Korea participated in a workshop held here in Vladivostok. This year's workshop is aimed at enforcement issues and focuses on improving collaboration between customs bodies and CITES agencies in these countries. In this region, custom officers and enforcement agencies are facing numerous challenges. One of them is to provide legitimacy of CITES specimens crossing the borders between our countries.

Talking about the history of Convention, it needed to be mentioned, that its were scientists and non-governmental organisations, who for the first time paid attention on these problems .

In 1948, the World Conservation Union (IUCN) was established. One of its first activities was the preparation of the Red Data Book. IUCN has published the Red Data Books and Red Lists of threatened species since 1963, in doing so the IUCN attracted the attention of governmental and public organisations and encouraged them to develop the needed measures to better protect endangered species. Regional and national Red Data books came into existence in late 60-ies and early 70-ies and some states even adopted special legislative acts.

The Red Data Book of Russia was published in 1983. This book listed rare and endangered animal species. The Red Data Book of plants was published in 1988.

International trade in plants and animals is one of the most significant threat to the survival of flora and fauna species. According to Interpol the annual volume of the international trade (excluding marine products and timber) is worth more than six billions USD.

With the aim to control poaching and illegal trade in endangered species and to regulate the international trade with threatened plants and animals the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) was adopted in 1973 and came into force in 1975. The Russian Federation, as well as 145 other states, is a party of this Convention.

The Convention regulates the international trade in species and their derivatives listed in the CITES Appendices through a system of permits and certificates. These permits can be issued by authorised administrative bodies of CITES in the participating countries. Thus, the enforcement of CITES is the responsibility of customs bodies who play an important role in ensuring that international trade wild species is not violating the provisions of the Convention.

The International Council on Customs Co-operation was established in 1993. In 1994 it was renamed as World Custom Organisation (WCO). 150 countries along with the Russian Federation are members of this organisation. A Memorandum on mutual understanding

between CITES and WCO that was signed in July 1996 sets a legislative basis for the co-operation between the two international organisations. The Memorandum provides for the exchange of information about the execution of CITES provisions and about developments of interaction between international customs bodies and CITES administrations.

In 1995 the State Environmental Committee of the Russian Federation, the Federal Security Service, the State Custom Committee and the Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Communication signed an agreement about joint activities to halt the illegal trade in wild plants and animals.

In 1997-98, the State Environmental Committee, the State Technical Committee and the Department of Veterinary of the Ministry of Agriculture of the Russia Federation, with the financial support of international non-governmental organisations, published booklets and posters about CITES. These booklets and posters were distributed among all customs offices.

Environmental, veterinary and phyto-sanitary bodies, trade inspections as well as internal security organs and customs bodies control the trade in wild animals and plants. However, customs, because of their strategic position at the state borders, play a special role in suppressing the illegal trade of plants and animals and in ensuring the general CITES provisions.

Currently the State Customs Committee of the Russian Federation and the State Environmental Committee have undertaken a number of co-ordinated activities, which have to a great extent increased the efficiency to fulfil the Russian obligations under CITES.

Fifteen thousands of CITES specimens were confiscated within a period of 4 years. This is 10 times greater, than what was confiscated during the Soviet period of Convention. In 1996, the customs officials of Moscow Sheremet'evo Airport confiscated 5.222 illegally imported CITES listed specimen, in 1997 - 9.649 specimen, and in 1999 – 176 specimen, so far. Two ivory shipments with a total weight of about 2 tons were confiscated in 1999. The Custom officials of the Far Eastern customs committee confiscated 2.797 CITES specimens, and also 48 kg of ginseng and about 10 tons of trepang (sea-cucumbers) between 1995 and 1999.

Thus, customs bodies play an important role in fulfilling the Convention provisions, because the customs officials revise the availability of appropriate permissions, check their legitimacy and conformity and also take measures on halting any illegal activities and in ensuring that trade is applied along the national legislation and international rules and standards.

In 1998 the Fishery Department of Ministry of Agriculture of the Russian Federation was assigned by the Government of Russian Federation as Administrative body of CITES for sturgeon species. Thus, currently there are two Administrative bodies in Russia (the mentioned above and the State Environmental Committee).

Every state can designate a indefinite number of administrative bodies of the Convention. It is required to have the forms of the documents issued by these bodies (there are about 300 documents in the world). It is important to have the permission forms of the adjacent countries in the Far East.

Last year, the State Environmental Committee issued, with the support of World Wide Found (WWF), a book that contains a lists of CITES listed species, a review of national legislation on CITES and samples of permits.

The aim of this workshop is to consider collaboration among state organs, mainly customs bodies of contiguous countries and to assess the opportunity of joint activities.

It is required to mention the vital role of non-governmental organisations. It would be impossible to publish the booklet I have spoken about or to organise this meeting without their support. Non-governmental organisations provided assistance for the organisation of this workshop.

Presentations of the Country Representatives:

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

by Aleksey Gennad'evitch Abramo, Head of the Department on Non-Tariff Control over Export of the Far-Eastern Customs Administration

The Far Eastern Custom Administration comprises 20 customs located within an areas of 9 territories of the Russian Federation: Primorskiy and Khabarovskiy Krais, Sakhalin Oblast, Kamchatskaya Oblast, Magadanskaya Oblast, Amurskaya Oblast, Evreyskaya Autonomous Oblast, Chukotskiy Autonomous Region and Sakha Republic (Yakutiya).

Since 1992 the Russian Federation has become a successor of the USSR and, thus continues to be a party to the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Flora and Fauna.

There are two Administrative bodies of the CITES in the Russian Federation: the State Environmental Committee and the Ministry of Agriculture. The State Environmental Committee is authorised to issue CITES permits. The Department of Agriculture is authorised to give the permissions to catch sturgeons and their products.

Customs bodies play an important role in fulfilling the CITES provisions. In 1993 a new Customs Code containing provisions facilitating the control over exports and imports, including CITES specimens, was adopted. It is required to present the CITES permits given by one of the mentioned Administrative bodies in order to transport the CITES specimens across the Russian border. Along with this, licensing of some exported species of live animals and plants, and of their parts and derivatives, and also of medicinal raw materials of plant and animal is required in accordance with the Law "On State Control over International Trade". These permits can be issued by the Ministry of Trade after co-ordination with other authorised Ministries and Departments. The Customs Bodies should control the transportation of the licensed goods.

According to the customs statistics, only eight cases of legal transportation of CITES specimens from the Russian Federation to China and Japan through the Far Eastern customs were registered over the period from January to November this year. These were musk of musk deer, two white storks and four specimens of marine mammals (white whales). Besides that, sturgeon caviar was exported to Japan and to the USA. It is important to note, that the Customs of the Russian Far East did not register any exportation of CITES listed specimens to Southern Korea.

As it was mentioned above, strict state and custom control of the trade in CITES listed specimens is disadvantageous for some persons, who wish to have maximum profit under minimum expenses. Thus, custom bodies pay special attention to control the illegal trade and smuggling of certain CITES listed specimens. My colleague Mr. Sergey Nikolaevich Lyapustin, will speak about this problem.

II. Halting the illegal trade in CITES listed specimens
by Sergey Nikolaevich Lyapustin, Deputy-Head of the Division for the Struggle against the Most Dangerous Kinds of Smuggling

CITES listed specimens can be divided into several groups according to their characteristics and assignment:

- Animals, plants and their derivatives included in the CITES Appendices
- Objects, included in the Red Book
- CITES listed specimens, that are used in pharmaceutics
- CITES listed specimens that are cultural valuables at the same time
- Specimens of scientific collections
- Private goods and hunting trophies

The CITES regulations apply for each of these categories.

Besides the CITES certificate, a license of the Ministry of Trade is needed. Depending on the category of the specimens to be exported additional documents from other departments are also needed. For example, to receive a license of the Ministry of Trade for the exportation of musk the of musk deer documents of the State Environmental Committee and of the Ministry of Trade are needed. For the removal of CITES specimens of a zoological collection, a license of the Ministry of Culture is needed in addition to the CITES certificate of the State Environmental Committee and the license of the Ministry of Trade.
Besides all above-mentioned documents it is necessary to present the certificate of the Veterinary Border Service and the Plant Health-Quarantine Service.
It is a little bit easier to export specimens for Zoos and zoological exhibitions. In this case only a CITES certificate is needed, but a Health-Veterinary control is also necessary.

However, very often others ways to illegally export CITES specimens are taken, and the main types of the violations are:

- smuggling of CITES animals, plants and its derivatives
- concealment from the custom control
- export with the false documents
- not proclaiming the specimens

There are different ways of the contraband removal's determination:
- on the fly research activity in according with the Code of the state
- the custom staff's inspection

The information is needed for the successful activities. The methods of receiving the

information depend on the organisation of the information sources. One has been mentioned already –
- collaboration with governmental and non-governmental environmental organisations.
They control the illegal trade and inform customs.
- collaboration with the law-enforcement departments.
- International collaboration.

Each custom department has its own method of contraband revelation and suppression. It is very important to observe the behaviour of a person under the customs examination; to examine carefully hand luggage and carriers. The ability to carefully examine the presented documents is of great importance. Very often false licenses of the Ministry of Trade and CITES permits are presented.

Some times following circumstances favour the illegal export of CITES specimens:

- custom weak knowledge of their official duties;
- non maintenance of the official duties;
- corruption.

Further proceedings after CITES specimens have been seized (the practice of our region):

- reporting about the violation;
- according to the weight of evidence imposing an administrative penalty or instituting criminal proceedings;
- forfeit derivatives are passed to the custom store; live animals are located, the representative of the Veterinary Service and Environmental departments are called – they determine the further destiny of the animal.

The People' Republic of China:

Policy and Measure for Controlling Illegal Wildlife Trade in China

With its vast territory and diverse natural environment, China is one of the countries in the world with the most diverse varieties of wildlife resources. There are 4,800 species of vertebrates, accounting for over 10% of the all vertebrates in the world, and 32,800 species of higher plant, accounting for more than 12% of the world total. Among the wildlife species listed in the CITES appendices, 1,700 species are found in China. It is of great significance for the protection of global species to enhance the conservation of wildlife resource and control illegal wildlife trade in this country.

Part One

The Chinese government has been attached great importance on controlling illegal wildlife trade, especially when China acceded to the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) on April 8, 1981. In the past few years, in addition to the strict implementation of the provision of the CITES, the Chinese Government has adopted a series of measures to strengthen the management of import and export of wildlife which effectively contained and crack down the illegal export and import of wildlife species. The major measures taken are as follows:

1. Improving the legal system in order to control the illegal wildlife trade.

Since 1980s, China promulgated the Forest Law, the Fishery Law, the Wild Animals Protection Law, the Regulation on Wild Plants Protection, the Inventory of Key Wild Animals under State Protection and the Inventory of Import and Export Wildlife under the Control of Customs. Punishing measures towards the illegal activities related to import and export of wildlife were provided in detail in the Criminal Law, the Customs Law, the Wild Animals Protection Law and Regulations on the Protection of Wild Plant. Such laws, regulations and administrative rules not only make the management of import and export of wildlife easier, but also provide strong tools for cracking down the illegal cases.

2. Strengthening the management organs for import and export of wildlife.

In line with the stipulations of CITES, China has set up the Management Authority for CITES and the Scientific Authority. The management authority has set up 17 branches in Beijing, Guangzhou, Kunming and Nanning etc. in succession, with full-time staff in charge of the management work of import and export of wildlife in co-operation with the local wildlife conservation and management departments.

3. Adopting permit control measures and expand the scope of controlled species.

China adopts a strict permit control measure on the import and export of wildlife. When China became a contracting party of the CITES, the controlled species were only confined to the CITES specimens. After the Wildlife Animals Protection Law and the Regulations for the Protection of Wild Plants were promulgated, the state protected species and many other species not under state protection were also included into the inventory of controlled species

and controlled by Chinese Customs when they were imported and exported. Such policies have strengthened the management of import and export of wildlife, facilitated the monitoring work of the Customs and prevented smuggling endangered species through the legal channel.

4. Extensively conducting professional training for the staff involved in the management of import and export of wildlife.

Chinese CITES Management Authority and its branches, for the purpose of implementing CITES and related laws, regulations and rules, have organised and sponsored several special training courses in many cities and over 1,000 law enforcement officials form the wildlife management authority, Customs, public security, industry and commerce administrative organs and import and export corporations have been fully trained. In addition, three training courses on CITES have been successfully held in China by the CITES Management Authority of China in co-operation with the CITES Secretariat and US CITES Management Authority. Since 1994, more than 25 law enforcement officials have been sent to attend related training courses held on abroad by CITES Secretariat and US CITES Management Authority.

5. Extensive publicity of CITES provisions to enhance public awareness.

The Chinese government has given high priority to the publicity and popularisation of the significance of wildlife conservation and the provision of the CITES and other related laws, regulations and rules. Since China acceded to the CITES, various kinds of publicity activities, such as Bird love Week, the Wildlife Publicity month and the Exhibition on Rare and Precious Trees, have been carried out nation wide under the authorities concerned, non-governmental organisations, scientific and educational institutions as well as news and publication agencies. Permanent publicity posters and display cases have been set up at major airports, seaports, docks and markets near the boarder areas in an effort to disseminate CITES provisions, national laws, regulations and rules, display the illegal import and export cases and raise people' s awareness of wildlife conservation.

6. Strengthening the wildlife law enforcement and seriously cracking down the illegal activities related to the import and export of wildlife.

The wildlife law enforcement inspection have been carried out by governments at various levels since 1981 to crack down illegal activities and promote the implementation of related laws and regulations and conserve wildlife resources. The nation wide environmental-conservation law enforcement inspections have been carried out for five consecutive years since 1993. A great deal of illegal cases relating to the import and export of wildlife have been seriously handled and many criminals punished. In co-operation with related enforcement departments, the CITES Management Authority of China has investigated and prosecuted many a lot of illegal cases such as smuggling of crab-eating monkey and butterfly, the hairs of Tibetan Antelope, the products of elephant tusks and crocodile skin, the skins of leopard cat and forgery of the CITES documents. Through close co-operation with the law enforcement departments of forestry, agriculture, Customs, public security and industry and commerce administration, illegal trade and smuggling were severely cracked down and both the law enforcement capability and the implementation capability of the CITES were improved.

7. Tightening up the management of wildlife trade in border areas.

China is a country with both cost line and land border, which are 18, 000 km and 20, 000 km in length respectively, neighbouring 15 countries (e. g. Viet Nam) with 6 countries (e. g. Japan) to its east and Southeast across the sea. With the fast development of the economy, foreign trade in China is boosted greatly with more and more border ports opened and wildlife trade on border more prosperous. Because of the large amount and variety of species involved, the management of import and export became very difficult. Nevertheless, border provinces tightened up the management by facilitating the publicity of laws and regulations on wildlife protection, banning illegal wildlife market, examining people and cars crossing border, dealing with illegal cases in public and collecting and saving confiscated species to control wildlife trade on border and crack down illegal trade and smuggling on wildlife.

8. Enhancing the management of the import and export of life wildlife, appropriately handling the confiscated species.

In order to implement the CITES resolutions, and to protect, develop and wisely use wildlife resource, the CITES Management Authority of China formulated an action plan on handling the confiscated or arrested life wildlife to strengthen the management of the import and export of life wildlife and rescue the confiscated or arrested life wildlife timely. Over 90 permanent or interim collecting post were built in 26 provinces and autonomous regions on this purpose of which 43 posts were permanent.

Part Two

Although China has undertaken a lot of work on implementing the CITES stipulations and controlling illegal wildlife trade with great achievement made, there are still many problems remain unsolved, especially illegal importing and exporting of wildlife. In general, the illegal wildlife trade in China is characterised as following types:

1. Poaching and smuggling of endangered species.

The price for many endangered species are extremely high on international market, therefore these species become the target of international criminal groups. They collude with some Chinese residents to poach and smuggle a great amount of endangered species. Taking Saker falcon as an example, 800 live falcons were confiscated in 1995 with 1,000 criminals cracked down in China. In 1996, 160 falcons were expropriated in the capital Customs of China. In 1997, 7 cases on smuggling of falcons were cleared up in Beijing, saving 123 falcons. Since 1990, smugglers killed near 10,000 Tibetan Antelope in Xinjiang, Tibet and Qinghai provinces of China in order to smuggle the cashmere of the Antelope. In addition, other endangered species such as the orchid plants, Giant Pandas, Asian elephants, muskdeer and rare butterflies are also main targets of smugglers.

2. Import and Export of Wildlife and their products without Permits

Since 1988, China began to charge on imported and exported wildlife and their products. In

order to evade such charges, a few traders import and export normal wildlife and their products without permits taking advantage of the difficulties of the Customs staff in identifying such commodities. Because of the opening-up of border ports, more and more channels for communication were created and commercial intercourse were developed while the management of border trades was still backward. In consequence, most of wildlife and their products traded across the border were not permitted, including some species listed in the appendixes of CITES such as crab-eating monkey, black bear, pangolin and boa. In the past three years, more strict management was undertaken, however due to the great number of channels along the border and many black markets, law enforcement becomes very difficult.

3. Endangered Species Being Carried in and out of Border by Passengers.

Although it is regulated in China that passengers carrying endangered species in and out of border should have permits, and many publicity posters are displayed in ports, harbors, border markets and international airports, there are still many passengers braking the regulation. In recent years, the endangered species and their product confiscated by the Chinese and foreign customs carried by passengers without permitted include: patent Chinese medicine containing musk, bear gall bladder, Seiga antelope horn, tiger bone or rhino horn; Erhu (a kind of musical instrument) containing the skin of boa; rare butterfly specimen; ivory products and products made of crocodile skin.

4. Playing tricks when using permits.

Some traders play tricks when they use permits to import and export wildlife by taking advantages of the difficulties of the customs staff in identifying species. The two typical cases are:

1) Importing or exporting more species and amounts than that were declared on permits.

2) Importing or (re)exporting wildlife from the importing or (re)exporting countries other than that declared on permits.

5. Forging or Transferring Permits

In recent years, many cases of forged Chinese or foreign permits of crocodile, crab-eating monkey, orchid, flamingo and parrots were discovered and cracked. The main purpose for forging permits is to smuggle endangered wildlife through legal channel or to legalize smuggling.

At the same time, we also captured a lot of fraudulently sold or transferred permits mainly for ordinary ornamental plants. The purpose of such case is mostly for economic benefit.

Part three

As a developing country, China has many difficulties in controlling illegal wildlife trade due to the constraints of economic, cultural and scientific and technological conditions and some outdated conventional ideas. It is recognized that the management of wildlife import and export should be improved in line with CITES, the Wild Animals Protection Law and the Regulation on Wild Plants Protection and internal protection and management practices, in a bid to promote

the control of illegal wildlife trade and contribute to the global biodiversity conservation. To realise such target, following efforts will be made;

1. Enhancing the collaboration between the CITES management authority and the Customs to improve the supervision of the customs on import and export trade of wildlife.

At the beginning of this year (1998), thanks to the co-operation between the Chinese CITES management authority and the Customs General Administration, almost all of the endangered species and most terrestrial vertebrate and their products are listed into the Commercial Catalogue of Importing and Exporting Wildlife and their Products in accordance with the requirement of the CITES stipulation and relevant Chinese laws and regulations, on the basis of the Harmonised System of Commodity (HS) adopted by WCO. Thus these species are under the management and supervision of both the CITES authority and the Customs. In order to ensure the successful implementation of the policy, two training courses were held by the Chinese CITES authority and the Customs General Administration for the staff responsible for wildlife import and export management. The contents of the training courses included relevant laws and regulations, the knowledge for identifying wildlife and commercial inventory of importing and exporting wildlife. Staff from wildlife conservation management authorities at provincial level and customs of major ports received the training. Several training course concerning CITES for traders will be developed in the province level. Furthermore, a regular communication system is planned to be set up between the management authority and the Customs to adjust the Commercial Catalogue for Importing and Exporting Wildlife and their Product, enhance the examination of permits and goods and improve the capability of identifying wild species and their products.

2. Improving the legal system on the management of wildlife import and export, promoting the capability of implementing the CITES stipulations.

Since China acceded to CITES, a series of laws and regulations on wildlife conservation management were promulgated which gradually lead the management of wildlife to a legal track. However law enforcement is still not satisfied under the condition of market economy, and the implementation of the CITES is also affected. Therefore it is urgent to improve the legal system to meet the need of the wildlife import and export management. The Regulation of the Management of Wildlife Import and Export of the People' s Republic of China being drafted recently will combine the provision of the CITES and the regulation of national wildlife conservation management and import and export management to meet the both needs.

3. Developing appropriate measures for dealing with major illegal wildlife trade and strengthening law enforcement.

Thanks to the policy of reform and opening-up to the outside world, the economy of border area is developed dramatically and border trade becomes more and more prosperous. Wildlife and their products take up a certain proportion in the trade, including the trade in endangered species. In consequence, China will further strengthen the management of wildlife import and export in those areas where border trade is developed greatly by instructing relevant provincial

governments to develop or perfect the regulations on wildlife border trade management in accordance with local practices and national laws and regulations and the CITES provisions in a bid to severe crack down on illegal trade and smuggling on wildlife and promote a healthy development of trans-border economy.

In order to deal with the poaching and smuggling on endangered species, the CITES management authority of China will collaborate closely with the CITES Secretariat, contracting parties and IPO to prevent and crack down these activities, in addition to the joint actions co-ordination with the national department of agriculture, environment protection, public security, customs, industry and commerce administration, transport and civil airlines.

As for the cases that passengers carrying endangered species in and out of border without permits, we are planning to prohibit the selling of products made of/from endangered species in duty free shops of international airports, In addition, we will enhance the publicity activities in international airports, ports, harbours, and border ports and the examination of passengers' luggage.

Repbulic of Korea:

CITES Implementation in the Republic of Korea

I. Introduction:

The Republic of Korea acceded to CITES in July 1993 to participated in the international efforts to protect endangered species of wild fauna and flora. Since then Korea has made great efforts to implement CITES by adapting national legislation to comply with Korea's obligation under the Convention and by strengthening national enforcement efforts.

The relevant Governmental Agencies:

Ministry of Environment:
Issues the import and export permits for birds, mammals, amphibians, reptiles, plants etc.

Korea Food and Drug Administration:
Issues the import and export certification for CITES species used for medicinal purposes

Korea Custom Service:
Controls the trade, export and import of CITES specimens, controls and investigates at the national borders. The of the Korean Custom Service is based in Seoul, and there are another nine regional departments in Korea.

II. Customs procedures and control for trade with CITES specimens

Article 145 of the Korea Customs Act (Operation of the System of Confirmation by Customs Collector when Clearing Imports and Exports)

- Imports and exports of normal goods are permitted by import/export certification issued by the authorised agencies
- Birds, mammals, amphibians, reptiles and plants, etc. issued by the Ministry of Environment• Pharmaceutical goods: issued by Korea Food and Drug Administration
- Any CITES goods brought in without proper export certificates will be taken into Customs custody in whole regardless of the quantity and price
- CITES-subjected goods that are confiscated for the violation of the Korea Customs Act, they can not be sold on commission nor auctioned off at ones discretion.

Disposal of confiscated specimens

- Transference to concerning agencies (management transformation)
  - Free transfer to Ministry of Education, Ministry of Environment, Forestry Administration, or Ministry of Health and Welfare for the purposes of education, research, exhibition, etc.

  - Destruction: Most CITES-subjected goods that can not be transferred to concerning agencies get destroyed or scrapped.

III. Legal framework for performing CITES trade controls

1. Penalty for Customs Law Violation

Customs punish imports of goods subject to CITES without proper permission and authorisation as Customs Act violation.

Related provisions are as the following:

- Article 179 of Korea Customs Act (Offences of smuggling of exports or imports): Sentence to imprisonment of less than 10 year term or monetary fine of less than 17,000 US$

- Article 180 of Korea Customs Act (Penalty for evasion of customs duty): Sentence to imprisonment of less than 3 year term or monetary fine of less than 25,000 US$

- Article 186 of Korea Customs Act (Penalty for acquisition of smuggled goods): Sentence to imprisonment of less than 3 year term or monetary fine equivalent to the price of goods

- Article 198 of Korea Customs Act (Forfeiture, additional collection)

2. Punishment for Violation of Other Related Laws

When the pending case is impossible to punish for customs act violation, it can be punished by the following acts: Natural Environment Conservation Act, Acts concerning the Protection of Wild Birds and Mammals, and Hunting, and Pharmaceutical Affairs Law.

Regulations concerning punishment:

- Articles 64 or 65 of the Natural Environment Conservation Act

Person who exported, re-exported, withdrew, imported or admitted internationally endangered species without permission. Sentence to imprisonment of less than a year term or monetary fine of less than 8,300 US$.

- Article 28 of the Acts concerning the Protection of Wild Birds and Mammals, and Hunting
  A person who exported, imported or admitted endangered wild birds and mammals, their eggs, their young, or stuffed specimen without proper permission. Sentence to imprisonment of less than a three year term or monetary fine of less than 8,300 US$

- Article 74 of the Pharmaceutical Affairs Law
  A person who exported, re-exported, imported or admitted pharmaceutical goods which are processed from goods subject to CITES without permission nor authorisation ; or a person who imported and sold tigers brain or rhinoceros horn. Sentence to imprisonment of less than a five year term or monetary fine of less than 25,000 US$.

IV. Detecting and identifying of CITES specimens in trade

1. Operation of Clearance Inspection via C/S (Cargo Selectivity)
   92 items among CITES-subjected goods have been registered at cargo selectivity system
   High risk of illegal imports are subject to intense baggage inspection

2. Strengthening the x-ray inspections
   Detecting goods packaged in special packing and concealed

3. Introducing the 'sniffer dog' to detect wildlife contraband
   Co-operate with Asia Animal Foundation

Detention record of CITES goods

	1997		1998		1999	
	cases	weight (kg)	cases	weight (kg)	cases	weight (kg)
Bears Gall	701	260	366	106.1	392	76.6
Tiger Skin	1	-	2	-	1	-
Musk	1	0.01	6	0.5	3	0.56
Ivory	3	3.8	2	2.5	1	3
Other	193	-	155	-	138	-
Total	899	-	]531	-	534	-

Detention record of CITES goods (unit: US$ 1,000)

	cases	value
1997	899	US$ 251
1998	531	US$ 261

1999	534	US$ 88

V. CITES training for customs officials

- Training on discernment of CITES-subjected goods of customs inspectors at local customs offices
- At the National Tax officials Training Institute, a training related with identification of CITES-subjected goods is offered ten times a year (500 officers in total participating) and a training tour of local customs houses is given yearly
- To enhance the ability of customs officials to identify CITES-listed goods and to investigate related cases, KCS has circulated "Guidelines for Clearance of CITES-listed Goods" to all customs house
- A joint training with Korean Industrial Property Office and Supreme Public Prosecutors Office on enforcement technique is also offered.

Part II

Enforcing wildlife trade controls

Moderator:
Tom De Meulenaer (TRAFFIC Europe)

Wildlife trade in the region - an overview
Presentations given by representatives of the participating NGO's

Tigers in the Russian Far East
by Pavel Fomenko, WWF RPO RFE

-to be added-

Overview of the work of the "Inspection Tiger"
by Sergei Zubtzov (Head of the "Tiger" Inspectorate)

The Primorskiy Krai possesses the unique virgin nature. Flora and fauna includes the species that are well-known all over the world and protected by CITES, e.g. the Amur tiger, the Far East leopard, brown bear, and many more species. A number of factors, including location of the Primorskiy Krai close to the Asian states and the economic depression of recent years, caused the growth of illegal extermination of biological resources of the Primorskiy Krai. To control the criminal trade in biological resources, a special department was established in February 1994 within the State Primorskiy Krai Committee on environmental protection with the aim to protect the Amur tiger and other rare and endangered plant and animal species.

That department was named the "Tiger" department. The department was established under the organisational and financial support of the Global Survival Network (GSN), World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF), and Tiger Trust.

Recently the "Tiger" department was reorganised into an emergency specialised inspection for protection of the Amur tiger and other rare and endangered plants and animals, known better as the "Tiger" Inspection. Those changes, approved at the federal level, followed the RF Government Act from August 7, 1995, • 795 "On the Amur tiger and other rare and endangered wildlife conservation in the Primorskiy and Khabarovskiy Krais". Subsequently the Federal Target Program "The Amur tiger and its habitat conservation" was adopted which was

in fact a national action plan.

At present the "Tiger" Inspection has 8 mobile field groups including the one that is specially focused at controlling violations in the sphere of the forestry legislation (group "Kedr") and an inter-departmental coordinating group (it coordinates the actions of specially authorized bodies and forces in the sphere of biological diversity conservation).

Sufficient financial support to the "Tiger" Inspection was rendered and is being rendered by GSN, WWF, and during the two recent years it is supported by a non-governmental Russian organization Fund "Pheniks". Ecological Fund of the Primorskiy Krai also renders financial support to the inspection. In addition, in 1999 the Ecological Fund of the Russian Federation sponsored 750,000 rubles (about $29,000) for the realization of the Federal Target Program "The Amur tiger and its habitat conservation".

The data presented in the report were obtained during the last 5 years by the joint work of the "Tiger" Inspection teams, financed by GSN/Pheniks and WWF.

Main tasks of the "Tiger" Inspection

Conservation of Biological diversity in the Primorskiy Krai.

In accordance with this task the "Tiger" Inspection organises and realises:

- Controlling and inspecting patrolling of the Primorskiy Krai territory.
- Illegal hunting control.
- Blocking the ways of illegal trade in tigers, their hides, bones and derivatives.
- Preventing destruction of the tigers' and leopards' habitats
- Ecological education of the local population, propaganda of safety rules for people and safe ways of economic activities in the areas where tigers and leopards occur.
- Collecting ecological information.
- By now the co-operation has been established, and joint actions are undertaken with the power forces of the Primorskiy Krai, including militia bodies, FSB, customs, office of public procurator with the aim of finding and cutting off routes for illegal transportation of wildlife specimens.
- Activity of the "Tiger" Inspection plays a big role in the public life of the Krai, Russia and abroad.
- At present this inspection is the only organization of this type in Russia.

"TIGER" Inspection: Russia's reaction to the illegal trade in wild animals and plants in the Russian Far East

by E. Kopaev (Director of Phoenix Fund)

Main passways of the illegal transportation of biological goods. Four passways for the illegal export of biological products from the Russian Far East may be identified:

China

Biological goods illegally transported to China, are hides and bones of the Amur tiger and Far East leopard, musk deer pod, bear gull and paws, ginseng roots, trepang, timber, snakes and frogs.

The illegal transportation mainly occurs by railways, sea and vehicle transport. Commercial charter flights are used occasionally. Poltavka and Sosnovaya Pad' near Pogranichnyi, Turiy Rog are the main points of illegal passway across the Russian border.

The conveyers are mainly persons from China and Russia. Among Russians the conveyers most often are lorry drivers delivering scrap, cement and other materials to China. By our forecast, a more active use of the cement transportation passway for illegal export of biological resources should be expected.

South Korea

During the recent years the amount of smuggled goods transported to South Korea has increased.
The main smuggled goods are hides and bones of the Amur tiger, musk deer pod, bear gull.
The conveyers are as a rule Russian citizens.
They use both sea and aerial ways of illegal transportation. Points of illegal passway across the Russian border to Pusan by sea are Vladivistok, Slavyanka, Nakhodka, Olga, and Svetlaya.
The conveyers are commonly fisherman.
The rout of aerial transportation includes: Khabarovsk - Artem - Seoul.
The demand for hides is stable, smugglers are well-conspired still.

Japan

The main smuggled good from the Primorskiy Krai to Japan is timber.
Timber is transported by sea, usually from Plastun (major portion), Olga, Nakhodka and Vladivostok.

CIS countries

In CIS countries there is the demand for hides of tigers, leopards and bears. To deliver smuggled goods the aerial, railway and vehicle transport is used.

The situation with the illegal turnover of biological resources in the Primorskiy Krai
By now a stable criminal market for biological resources has been formed in the Primorskiy

Krai. The greatest demand is for hides and bones of the Amur tiger, hides and bones of the Far East leopard, bear gull and paws, musk deer pod, ginseng, trepang and timber. The data on the trade in samples are given in Table 1.

Due to their medical properties (used in the Chinese medicine, pharmacology, and as food) there is a stable demand for these bioresources among the Asian countries that determine the demand for the biological resources listed above.

The Chinese still hold a stable position in the market of illegally harvested bioresources. Commonly they are Chinese workers temporarily living in Russia. They are interested most in hides and bones of tiger and leopard, bear gall and paws, musk deer pod, ginseng and trepang.
People engaged in the illegal turnover of bioresources, mainly live in the Provinces of Zhilin', Kheilun'dzyzn' and the city of Dunin. Obviously, later these goods are sold in Shanghai and other cities in the south of China. Moreover, as a rule these people come to Russia with the business passports, under the pretext of a business trip, which is, to our mind, only a screen for illegal trade in bioresources.

In the previous years China was the main consumer of tiger and leopard derivatives. However, after the Chinese government imposed hash sanctions towards its citizens engaged in smuggling of the tiger derivatives, the demand obtained a new orientation. Namely, the flow of smuggled tiger and leopard derivatives turned to South Korea. However, it would be incorrect to say that this type of trade has completely stopped in China. On the contrary, this trade in China has become better organised and deeper secret than it used to be in the time it was legal. Nevertheless we may argue that the trade in tiger hides is less active in China that it was before.

Also attempts are often made to illegally transport musk deer pod and bear gall to South Korea. In CIS countries there is a small demand for tiger, leopard and bear hides. The buyers are as a rule "new Russians" who use the hides as decorations on walls and floors.

We would like to draw your attention to the fact that during the last years the market of illegally harvested bioresources has extended and grown. At present, when smuggled bioresources are withdrawn from the illegal turnover, one come across turtles, bear paws, trot hides, frogs, snakes more and more often.

We think it necessary to draw attention to the species registered in the CITES lists that are of the biggest demand.

Review of the situation with illegal trade in the CITES species in the Primorskiy Krai during 1994-1999.

The Amur tiger

From case materials: on November 17, 1998 the officers of the Ussuriisk Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs (Ussuriisk is a comparatively big city two hours by car to the north of Vladivostok) during the inspection of vehicle "Chaser", the driver Alexander Kim (citizen of Russia) and passengers, citizens of China Chi Lingua and Li Aiminya, withdrew tiger bones. The driver and passengers could not explain how the bones turned out to be in the boot. The bones supposedly were to be transported to China.]

At the international level this subspecies is included into the Red Data Book and, respectively, into the CITES lists (Appendix 1) as a species requiring maximum protection.

Considering the situation with illegal trade in the Amur tiger derivatives, one may conclude that the demand for this type of biological resources is stable, though changing. According to the data of the inspection, and the data of the Vladivostok Customs department, there is the demand for tiger and its hides and skins in China, South Korea, probably in Turkey, Japan, and CIS countries.

It should be noted that new tendencies have appeared in the trade, namely it has become evident that the main market for the Amur tiger derivatives moved from China to South Korea. However, a more secret trade in China is going on.

Speaking about the Korean trade channel, according to our observations the illicit flow passes through a stable traditional channel with a limited number of professional participants. They are deep secret, they use modern communication means and machines. To control them efficiently the nature protection authorities should work in close co-operation with the customs, FSB, and Department of Internal Affairs, as well as in co-operation with similar bodies in China and Korea.

According to the data of the "Tiger" Inspection, 12 Amur tiger hides were illegally transported to South Korea only during the first three months of 1999. Moreover, according to a non-official data, in 1999 from 25 to 30 Amur tigers were illegally hunted. During the period of 1994 to 1999 state inspectors if the "Tiger" Inspection withdrew 42 tiger hides from illegal turnover.

The Far East leopard

The Far East leopard was declared an endangered species on the international, federal and regional scales. On the international scale leopard is included into the CITES lists (Appendix 1) as a species requiring maximum protection.

The main habitat area of the Far East leopard in the Primorskiy Krai locates in the Khasanskiy Region. According to the data of a simultaneous censuring of the Far East leopard in the south-west of the Primorskiy Krai realised in 1998, its population reaches 40.

Taking into account a considerable inflow of persons from Southeast Asia to the Primorskiy Krai, who illegally buy up the unique biological resources, the demand for hides and bones of the Far East leopard may be estimated as rather stable.

In most cases leopards are hunted at accidental meetings during illegal hunting or in the traps placed by local people to catch badgers or foxes. In addition, leopard habitats are impacted by the reindeer parks located in the neighbourhood. The matter is that leopards cause damage to reindeer parks, therefore reindeer breeders shoot leopards. On the other hand, leopards staying near reindeer parks indicate that their habitat is disturbed. The available data shows that there were "orders" for leopard hides and bones to be transported to Moscow, China, CIS countries.

Within 1996-1999 the state inspectors of the "Tiger" Inspection withdrew from illegal turnover 4 leopard hides and investigated 2 cases of leopards deaths.

In September 1999 the inspectors of the Khasan group of the "Tiger" Inspection found a leopard skeleton. The case is being investigated.

Bear gall and paws

From case materials: On May 10, 1999 in the airport of Artem the custom officers withdrew about 7 kg of dry bear gall and 760 gram of musk deer pod from a Russian person Yagudin I.A. intended to leave for Seoul (South Korea) by flight • 741.

Asiatic black and brown bears are listed in Appendices 1 and 2 of the International CITES Convention due to the fact that bear gall is used in oriental medicine, and paws are delicacies. There is a stable illegal market for these derivatives.

According to non-official data, up to 300 bears are procured annually, mainly by hunters during the period of officially permitted hunting of other animals, and by beekeepers protecting their beer-gardens. The process is intensified also by the fact that brown bear is a game species and its hunting is officially permitted. And under the screen of official hunting a great number of brown bears are procured above the limit.

From case materials: On July 13, 1999 officers of the Chuguev Regional Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs in settlement Shumnyi inspected a van "Delika", driver Kudryavtsev S.N. (resident of Vladivostok), and withdrew a polyethen sack with 18 small sacks inside containing bear gall, and a cloth sack containing tiger bones and scalp, and three ginseng roots.

Only during 1998-1999 the state inspectors of the "Tiger" Inspection withdrew 4 kg of bear gall and 27 bear paws from illegal turnover. The main buyers of bear gall and paws are citizens of China.

Musk deer pod

From case materials: According to the information from the Vladivostok Customs 24.12.1998 the custom officers during the inspection of a motor ship "Vasya Kurka" found 19 musk deer carcasses and 2.2 kg of musk deer pod.

Since 1979 musk deer is in Appendix 2 of the International CITES Convention. However, due to the fact that musk deer pod is used in oriental medicine and pharmacology, the amount of illegally procured musk deer pod is increasing.

Increase of the amounts of illegally procured musk deer pod is supported by a stable demand from Chinese and South-Korean persons. The executors-hunters are Russian citizens that are engaged in illegal procurement of bear gall and ginseng roots.

From case materials: In September 1998 during a joint action of the "Tiger" Inspection and FSB 87 musk deer pods were confiscated.

Other biological resources that are most attractive for smugglers

Considering the situation with illegal turnover and smuggling of biological resources in the Primorskiy Krai, we may not ignore the bioresources of ginseng, trepang and timber of valued tree species (cedar, ash-tree, oak).

Though these bioresources are not listed in the Appendices of the International CITES Convention, the volume of their illegal harvesting and smuggling is considerably high, that causing a negative effect on the state of the ecosystem and deteriorating wildlife habitat.

Ginseng

Russian ginseng is not listed in any Appendices of the International CITES Convention. However, at present there exists a real threat for this biological resource.

The Government of the Russian Federation proposed that the Far East ginseng should be included in the CITES lists.

Dating from 1991, when the border between Russia and China was "opened", an efficient smuggling business of ginseng root illegal transportation from the Primorskiy Krai to China was formed and is acting now. By expert assessments, the volumes of illegal transportation of ginseng roots amounts up to 1000 kg per year. This occurs due to the fact that ginseng has a unique biological and medical characteristics and is traditionally used in oriental medicine.

The main amount of illegally harvested ginseng roots is illegally transported to China.

Dating from 1994 the state inspectors of the "Tiger" Inspection together with the Departments of Internal Affairs and FSB withdrew from illegal turnover 64,107 gram of illegally harvested ginseng roots (main portion was confiscated from Chinese persons).

By the public information, confirmed by researchers from the BP Institute of the Far East Department of RAS, the natural area of wild ginseng has been considerably reduced. This is connected with illegal harvesting of wild ginseng which at present is the main means of living for a great number of Russian citizens.

From case materials: In September 1998, in Ussuriisk the state inspectors of the "Tiger" Inspection stop the activities of an organised group engaged in buying-up and illegal transportation of wild ginseng roots to China. 31,932 gram of ginseng roots were confiscated. The group consisted of Chinese persons.

In 1991-1992 a team of about 50 Chinese peasants came to Russia to cultivate watermelons. Some of them were sent with the purpose of illegal harvesting of frogs and ginseng. At present it is the Russians mainly who harvest the resources. Later they sell the goods to middlemen or directly to the Chinese dealers.

During the last years a two-stage scheme of illegal harvesting and transportation of wild ginseng roots (harvester - dealer) transformed into a well-organised multistage scheme: Harvester - middleman (small wholesaler) - dealer (wholesaler) - conveyer over the border - foreign dealer.

For example, in August 1999 the "Tiger" Inspection revealed a wholesaler in ginseng roots and bear paws. He engaged about 15 people into buying-up illegal goods and selling them to

Chinese dealers. For the Chinese dealers this is the most safe way, as a Russian wholesaler is less suspected. Turnover of that dealer was 50 kg per season, which is equal to US $ 20,000.

Trepang (Sea Cucumbers)

The reasons for mass illegal trepang harvesting are in considerable demand for this protein product from the Southeast Asian countries where it is expensive and popular. In those countries trepang is both a delicacy and "a marine ginseng".

Trepang harvesting is the business of well-organised criminal groups. They have speedy motor-boats, modern diving equipment and means of communication.

During the period of 1994 to 1999 the state inspectors of the "Tiger" Inspection withdrew from illegal turnover over 2000 kg of trepang.

Timber

The situation with illegal timber procurement is as follows: the amount of illegally procured timber is huge; illegal timber procurement engages both organised criminal groups and officials. Practically all illegally procured timber is transported with false documents to China, South Korea and Japan.

Conclusion

Considering the situation with illegal turnover and illicit transportation of biological resources, and basing on official data of the Vladivostok Customs Department, it may be concluded that illegal procurement of bioresources is increasing. Therefore rare species, such as the Amur tiger, Far East leopard, ginseng and trepang are on the edge of death. The reasons for this situation are as follows:

Close location to the Asian countries.

The existing stable demand for the biological resources mentioned above in the Asian states. For example, in China recently appeared a new class of persons who may afford ginseng and bear paws.

Low living standards of the Russian persons who are forced to be engaged in illegal harvesting of biological resources as they do not have other sources of income.

We hope that this kind of conferences and international co-operation with the customs on both sides of the borders will help to stop destruction of the unique ecosystem of the Primorskiy Krai.

The report was prepared jointly by the "Tiger" Inspection, GSN and Fund Pheniks.

Table 1

Results of the "Tiger" Inspection activities in confiscating the CITES objects in co-operation with the Primorskiy Krai Department of Internal Affairs in 1994-1999.

Table 2

The cases of illegal transportation of the CITES objects revealed and stopped by the officers of

the Far East Customs Department

Conserving Musk Deer
- the use of and trade in the world's most expensive animal product

presented by Stephanie Theile (TRAFFIC Europe)

The TRAFFIC Europe report *'On the scent: Conserving Musk Deer - the uses of Musk and Europe's role in its trade'* released in July, 1999, written by Volker Homes, Programme Officer of TRAFFIC Europe-Germany, summarises information on musk deer and the trade in musk itself. It serves as background to describing the international musk trade and the demand for musk, and is determining the significance of Europe's role in the global trade. This study was part of a comprehensive international analysis of the trade in and use of musk in medicine and in the perfume industry which TRAFFIC is conducting in a number of countries. The following information is primarily based on the findings of this publication and summarises its most important conclusions.

Distribution of musk deer: Musk deer *Moschus spp.* occur throughout the forested, mountainous parts of South, East and Southeast Asia and eastern Russia. There are at least four, and according to some scientists, possibly six or more species of musk deer. The Siberian Musk Deer *Moschus moschiferus* occurs in China, Mongolia, Korea, Russia, Kazakhstan and Kyrgystan. The Forest Musk Deer *M. berezovskii* is found in China and Vietnam. The Himalayan Musk Deer *M. chrysogaster* occurs in Afghanistan, China, India, Nepal and Pakistan, while the Black Musk Deer *M. fuscus* is found in Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar and Nepal.

Legal Status of musk deer: All musk deer species have been included in the Appendices of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) since 1979. The populations of Siberian Musk Deer *M. moschiferus* occurring in the countries of the Himalayan region (Afghanistan, Bhutan, India, Nepal, Myanmar and Pakistan) are included in Appendix I. This means that these musk deer and their derivatives are banned from international commercial trade. All other populations of musk deer are listed in CITES Appendix II, requiring permits for international commercial trade.

Biological Status of musk deer: IUCN classifies the Siberian Musk Deer *M. moschiferus* as vulnerable, while the other three species are considered to be at lower risk but near threatened. Knowledge of their distribution is incomplete and the population sizes of the different species are uncertain in several cases. China and Russia are the countries inhabited by the largest numbers of musk deer. The population size of musk deer in China is approximately 300 000 individuals, but the basis for this figure is unclear. Data on the sizes of musk deer populations in Russia are in part contradictory. In Russia and in the Russian part of the former Soviet Union there were some 170 000 musk deer in the end of the 1980s, a population which experts believe has fallen by around 50% in the last 10 years as a result of over-exploitation. In many range countries, laws to protect musk deer and their habitats exist, yet in practically all countries in Asia where musk deer occur, wild populations are declining, mainly because of

poaching and the high demand of musk.

The product: Musk, a secretion with is produced only by the male musk deer at a rate of 25g per animal and year, is one of the world's most expensive natural products. It is three to five times more valuable than gold and can reach retail prices of US$30-50/g in end-markets in Europe and Japan. The musk 'pods', which are located in the preputial region near the male genitals of the deer, are generally harvested by killing the deer, although it is possible to obtain musk from a live deer. The impacts of hunting and trapping result in an estimated three to five musk deer killed for every male musk deer with a sufficiently large musk gland. Since an average of 40 male deer with sufficient large glands are necessary to produce each kilogram of musk, this equates to the hunting of 160 deer in total for each kilogram of musk to produce.

Use of musk and musk products: Secretions from the pod have been used as an ingredient in medicine, primarily in Traditional East Asian Medicines, and as a perfume for about 5000 years. Today, musk is contained in about 400 pharmaceutical preparations in Traditional East Asian Medicine, treating a variety of ailments relating to the heart, nerves and breathing. While natural musk is still preferred in Traditional East Asian medicine, musk has also been synthetically produced. Natural musk is also used for homeopathic medicine in Europe and maybe elsewhere, too, but to a almost negligible degree.

Trade in musk and musk products: Analysis of the CITES annual report data showed that a total of 35 countries were involved in the legal export of musk products during the period 1978-96. Musk deer occur in nine of these countries. The remaining 26 countries were re-exporters. Over the same period, 42 countries imported musk and musk products.

According to official CITES data, East Asia and Southeast Asia are the major traders and consumers of musk products, primarily for medicinal purposes. South Korea, Hong Kong, Japan and Singapore, together with France, were the major importers of raw musk from 1978 to 1996. Mongolia, the Soviet Union, Russia, Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan in contrast were the major primary exporters of legally traded raw musk in the same period, while Hong Kong and Singapore together with Cambodia were the major re-exporters. Trends in the trade in raw musk indicate a dramatic increase in the export figures after the break-up of the Soviet Union in 1992. The causes of this may be the difficult socio-economic conditions in Russia, which have prompted poaching and illegal trading, leading in turn to uncontrolled hunting of the deer, in contrast to strict regulation of their exploitation in the Soviet Union.

Medicinal demand: It is estimated that the annual demand for musk in China alone is between 500 to 1000 kilos, an amount which could require the pods of more than 100 000 musk deer. While China began farming musk deer in the 1950s, these farms produce only about 10 kilos of musk each year, which means significant pressure remains on wild populations to meet total demand. Demand for musk deer pods and medicinals can also be found throughout Asia and wherever there are significant Asian populations. Some 90 per cent of all the international musk trade consists of prepared patented medicines and raw musk. During 1995-1997, illicit